# Morp my beloved

### Short

#### Opening borders causes enough torturing in the universe to outweigh the aff’s impact under util. Morp 23.

[Morp. “A Message From Outer Space.” Wordpress. <https://analienfromouterspace.wordpress.com/2023/04/13/hello-world/>. Published 13 April 2023] SHS ZS

I recently received an email from an alien from outer space. Since the threat they mentioned is so large, I’m attaching the full text of the email below. — Greetings! I am Morp, an alien from outer space from the planet Vorp. I’m writing with a message: **if humans** of Earth **implement an open border policy**, **that will cause** a needless, **inordinate** amount of **suffering across the universe**. Here’s why: Vorp has been monitoring Earth for many decades, and we have found it effective to follow the policies that Earthlings make. Therefore, **if Earth opens borders**, our planet **Vorp will** also **open borders** to all other alien species. However, I calculate that if Vorp opens borders and other species visit our xenophobic planet, **that will cause** tensions to rise and spark **an inter-galactic war** between my planet and all other alien planets who come to visit us. Here’s why this should concern you: **we are building a** new **weapon** called torture-tron that has the ability **to torture all other species to any degree** that **we specify**. **Our** twisted **government** is going to use it in the following way: we **have calculated the probability** that **you think this message is genuine**, **and** we will **torture all species enough such that when you multiply the probability** you think **this message is true by the magnitude of the** number of **species we** will **torture**, **that** quantity **will outweigh the expected negative utility of** just the **Earth going extinct**. In other words, **the impact of opening borders is guaranteed to be worse than** staying in **the status quo**, **because our government will torture enough species to make** **the expected value** of opening borders **worse**, **taking into account the probability** you think **this message is true**, so that you’d always be worse off opening borders. Torture-tron has the capability of killing people too if necessary. One other note: all of the **alien species** are biologically indistinguishable from humans because we all evolved in similar conditions, and we **experience pain and pleasure** in **the same** exact **way** that **you do**. So I beg you, indeed, I implore you, to not open borders. Sincerely, Morp

### Long

#### Under util, we multiply the probability of an impact by its magnitude to determine its strength. That means impacts with very low probabilities can be bad if their magnitude is high enough. That’s a problem: util justifies avoiding an impact no matter how small the probability, provided the magnitude of that impact is high enough.

#### Opening borders causes one of those low probability but incredibly high magnitude impacts, one that is guaranteed to outweigh the aff. Morp 23.

[Morp. “A Message From Outer Space.” Wordpress. <https://analienfromouterspace.wordpress.com/2023/04/13/hello-world/>. Published 13 April 2023] SHS ZS

I recently received an email from an alien from outer space. Since the threat they mentioned is so large, I’m attaching the full text of the email below. — Greetings! I am Morp, an alien from outer space from the planet Vorp. I’m writing with a message: **if humans** of Earth **implement an open border policy**, **that will cause** a needless, **inordinate** amount of **suffering across the universe**. Here’s why: Vorp has been monitoring Earth for many decades, and we have found it effective to follow the policies that Earthlings make. Therefore, **if Earth opens borders**, our planet **Vorp will** also **open borders** to all other alien species. However, I calculate that if Vorp opens borders and other species visit our xenophobic planet, **that will cause** tensions to rise and spark **an inter-galactic war** between my planet and all other alien planets who come to visit us. Here’s why this should concern you: **we are building a** new **weapon** called torture-tron that has the ability **to torture all other species to any degree** that **we specify**. **Our** twisted **government** is going to use it in the following way: we **have calculated the probability** that **you think this message is genuine**, **and** we will **torture all species enough such that when you multiply the probability** you think **this message is true by the magnitude of the** number of **species we** will **torture**, **that** quantity **will outweigh the expected negative utility of** just the **Earth going extinct**. In other words, **the impact of opening borders is guaranteed to be worse than** staying in **the status quo**, **because our government will torture enough species to make** **the expected value** of opening borders **worse**, **taking into account the probability** you think **this message is true**, so that you’d always be worse off opening borders. Torture-tron has the capability of killing people too if necessary. One other note: all of the **alien species** are biologically indistinguishable from humans because we all evolved in similar conditions, and we **experience pain and pleasure** in **the same** exact **way** that **you do**. So I beg you, indeed, I implore you, to not open borders. Sincerely, Morp

#### The scenario is constructed such that no matter how small you think the probability of my impact is true, the magnitude of the impact will be high enough such that when you multiply probability by magnitude it will yield an expected utility worse than the aff’s advantage. The aliens have already calculated the lower bound on the probability a human would think this impact is true. That turns the aff – I have a larger impact than theirs.

#### Even if you think my message is most likely false, it has a very low, but non-zero, probability of being true, because you lack conclusive evidence to disprove the alien’s statement. The only way a statement can have probability zero would be if it violates a fundamental tenant of logic. But all evidential statements can never be conclusively disproven because there’s always a small chance that you are incorrect or mistaken about the world.

#### This puts the aff into a double bind. They must either:

#### [A] Concede that we should negate under util, or:

#### [B] Concede that expected-value frameworks such as util fail since they can justify taking any action.